**Ethical Issues in Global Health**

**Philosophy 344**

*Fall 2018*

Founders’ Hall 210

Lisa Eckenwiler, Ph.D.

Associate Professor

Philosophy | Health Administration and Policy

Office: Robinson B 465 / Email: [leckenwi@gmu.edu](mailto:leckenwi@gmu.edu) / Office Hours: TR on request

**Objectives**

In this class we will:

1. consider ethical questions and concerns that arise in global health policy and practice, primarily for governments, international health organizations, and humanitarian health organizations and health workers;

2. study and employ the rich resources of moral philosophy—ethical theories, concepts, and principles—for guidance in (1) identifying, (2) analyzing, and (3) deciding how best to respond to these and related concerns;

3. enhance our capacities to explore and address ethical issues in other domains.

**Course requirements**

1. Come to class on time for the full session ***with*** the readings, having read them carefully.

2. Complete a research project in five parts:

* Part 1: Proposal. Due **by** **October 4**. (10 points)
* Part 2: Outline. Due **by November 1.** (20 points)
* Part 3: Presentation. Due **November 27, 29**. (20 points)
* Part 4: Research Paper. Due **December 11**. (30 points)

*Please see Appendix 1 for further details on each part and helpful resources.*

3. Read one relevant book and describe it and selected ethical issues in two ways:

* Presentation (10 points)
* Short critical analysis essay (10 points)

*Please see Appendix 3 for further details and suggestions.*

**Elective opportunities**

1.Students are welcome and encouraged to participate in monthly semi-formal lunchtime discussions of ethical issues identified and raised generally in their internship experiences.

2. Talks at Mason and in the surrounding area at other universities on relevant issues. TBA. In approved cases extra credit is available.

**Course materials**

1. S. Benatar and G. Brock, eds. 2011. *Global Health and Global Health Ethics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press;

2. Required readings posted on Blackboard (B).

**Course policies**

1.All students should adhere to the university’s honor code: <http://www.gmu.edu/academics/catalog/9798/honorcod.html>.

2. Please use your GMU email accounts.

3. Assignments are subject to change. Please keep abreast of developments.

4. Please arrive for class on time and stay for the entire class.

5. Please don’t eat or use mobile phones or laptops in class.

6. If you miss class please consult classmates for announcements and other information.

7. All submitted work must be typed.

8. Writing assignments must be submitted in hard copy. Email submissions must be approved in advance of the due date except in cases of documented emergency.

9. Assignments not submitted directly to me must be signed by another faculty member or Mr. Santos, the Philosophy Department’s Office Manager, noting the date and time.

10. Late assignments will lose points equivalent to a full letter grade for each full day late except in cases approved in advance or in the event of a documented emergency.

11. Plagiarized work will receive a failing grade on the assignment and a case will be filed with the Honor Council. Students are expected to know how to properly document sources and avoid plagiarism.

12. You might want to work with, and may be referred to, the GMU Writing Center staff.

13. Please be aware that Mason offers resources for counseling, disabilities, health care, sexual assault and harassment through the Office of Disability Services, Counseling and Psychological Services, or Student Health Services.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**SCHEDULE OF CLASS MEETINGS , READING, AND OTHER ASSIGNMENTS**

**Week 1: August 28**

**Introductions**

**Weeks 2-3: September 4, 6, 11, 13**

**Defining Global Health, Health Inequities and Origins, The Ethical Significance of Health**

Benatar and Upshur, What Is Global Health?

Koplan et al. Toward a Common Definition of Global Health(B)

Labonte and Schrecker, The State of Health in A Radically Unequal World: Patterns and Prospects

Birn, Addressing the Social Determinants of Health: The Key Global Health Ethics Imperative of Our Times

Wolff, The Human Right to Health

Venkatapurum, Health Inequalities, Capabilities, and Global Justice, in Lenard and Straehle (B)

**Weeks 4-5: September 18, 20, 25, 27**

**Health in an Unequal World: Context**

Koivusalo, Trade and Health: Ethics of Global Rights, Regulation, and Redistribution

Rudin and Sanders, Debt, Structural Adjustment, and Health

Eckenwiler, Care Worker Migration and Transnational Justice (B)

Fried, Butler, and McMichael, Climate Change and Health: Risks and Inequities

McIntyre and Rondeau, Food Security and Global Health

Gill and Bakker, The Global Crisis and Global Health

**Week 6: October 2, 4**

**Obligations to Address Global Health Inequities: Why or Why Not**

Hunter and Dawson, Is There a Need for Global Health Ethics? For and Against

Benatar, Daar, and Singer, Global Health Ethics: The Rationale for Mutual Caring

**Weeks 7-8: October 11, 16, 23, 25**

**Migration, Health and Ethics: Responsibilities for Care**

Film in class: *Clinica Migrantes*

Illingworth and Parmet, The Right to Health: Why It Should Apply to Immigrants (B)

Dwyer, On Taking Responsibility for Undocumented Migrants (B)

TBA re: US border

Wild and Dawson, Migration: A Core Public Health Ethics Issue (B)

Eckenwiler and Wild, Justice for refugees living under long term displacement and segregation: from “livelihoods” to “place-making” (B)

**Weeks 9-10: October 30, November 1, (6), 8**

**Infectious Disease: Origins and Definitions, Management, Public Health Messaging, Representations and Stigma**

Selgelid, Justice, Infectious Diseases and Globalization

Gostin, A Retrospective and Prospective Analysis of the West African Ebola Virus… (B)

Dawson, What Ebola Teaches Us about Medical Ethics (B)

NYT, Zika Is a Global Health Emergency, WHO Says (B)

Jamrozik and Selgelid, Ethics, Policy and Zika (B)

PAHO, *Zika Ethics Consultation: Ethics Guidance on Key Issues Raised by the Outbreak*

Luna, Public Health Agencies’ Obligations and the Case of Zika (B)

Saenz, Zika: Ethics Preparedness for Old and New Challenges (B)

McNeil, Zika Failures (B)

Picturing Humanitarian Healthcare. See <https://humanitarianhealthethics.net/home/picturing-humanitarian-healthcare/>

Karamonzian, Ebola and Stigma (letter) B)

**Week 11: November 13, 15**

**Prioritization of Projects**

Rubenstein, The Distributive Commitments of International NGOs (B)

TBA

**Week 12: November 27, 29**

**Presentations**

**Final meeting: December 18**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**APPENDIX 1**

**RESEARCH PROJECT**

Your project will explore and critically analyze an ethical issue or philosophical problem of your choice concerning global health practice, policy, or research.

***a) PROPOSAL***

**Important to note:**

1. Value: 10 points

2. Recommended length: 3-5 sentences.

**Description:**

Your proposal should explain what your intended topic is and what specific questions or concerns plan to examine. There are many ways to go about this and I am open to your ideas. In general, I recommend taking one of the following three approaches:

1. Focus on an ethical concept or principle (for instance, justice) and how it should be understood and how it might guide the future provision of health care services, the formulation of health policy, or the conduct of research with humans in a global context.

2. Analyze a particular policy or practice with a focus on ethical concerns.

3. Examine the moral experience of patients (such as aid recipients or indigenous people), or particular kinds of health professionals (such as nurses in humanitarian settings) or decision makers (such as health policy leaders in government, managers of global health programs).

***PROPOSAL EVALUATION***

1. topic area

2. your ethical questions or concerns

3. syntax, diction, spelling, punctuation

***b) OUTLINE***

**Important to note:**

1. Value: 20 Points

2. Recommended length: 1 page, with subheadings and bullets for each element (1-2 sentences) following the introduction, and a separate page for references.

3. References: four, annotated and complete

**Description:**

Your outline should present the basic structure for your research paper and presentations.

In most cases it should follow this basic structure:

*1. Introduction*

a. What issue do you intend to focus on?

b. What specific ethical question(s) or concern(s) do you intend to analyze?

*2. Ethical concerns and arguments in the literature*

a. Present what others have said about the issue in the literature you have reviewed:

What are their various ethical positions? What reasons do they give for their views?

*3. Your ethical concern(s) and tentative argument*

Present your view and defend it with strong reasons. What is your argument?

***OUTLINE EVALUATION***

1. Introduction

2. Presentation of others’ ethical arguments

3. Presentation of your tentative position and moral reasons

4. Organization, syntax, diction, spelling

5. References

***c) PRESENTATION EVALUATION***

1. Introduction: explanation of issue and selected ethical questions/concerns

2. Presentation of others’ ethical arguments

3. Presentation of your tentative position and moral reasons

4. Raise good questions for others.

***d) RESEARCH PAPER***

**Important to note:**

1. Value: 30 points

2. Recommended length: 10-12 pages double-spaced (12-inch font) not including references

3. References: five, appropriate and complete

**Description:**

Here you integrate your research with your own reasoning and integration of ethical reasons for your argument(s) for how to understand and respond to the question(s) or issue(s) you are concerned with. Imagine yourself presenting an extended argument to professionals who are bright but know little about your particular concerns and even less about ethics. Enlighten them and give them new knowledge about the issue and its ethical significance—what is at stake in terms of health and ethics. Please follow this structure unless we agree otherwise:

*1. Introduction*

a. What issue do you intend to discuss?

b. Why is it morally pressing according to the literature you have examined?

c. What position do you intend to argue for and what are your reasons?

d. Give a concise summary of how the paper will be organized to get to your conclusion.

*2. Background information*

a. Present any relevant background information (case law, statistics, existing or developing law, policy) to help orient the reader to the issue, its scope and significance.

*3. Ethical concerns and arguments identified in the literature*

a. Present what others have said about the issue in the literature you have reviewed. Give ethical positions that differ equal presentation.

*4. Your ethical concerns and argument*

a. Present your view in as much detail as possible.

b. Defend it with as many strong moral reasons as you can.

*5. Objections and Responses*

a. Identify at least one and ideally, two or three possible criticisms or objections.

b. Respond to these, explaining why the position you defend is the better one.

*6. Implications*

a. Explain how policy, practice, or research should be changed, in light of your argument.

*7. Conclusion*

***RESEARCH PAPER EVALUATION***

1. Introduction: statement of issue, selected ethical concerns/questions, thesis

2. Presentation of others’ ethical arguments

3. Presentation of your position and support with ethical reasons

4. Objections and clarification of why your moral reasons are more persuasive

5. Discussion of recommendations for policy & practice

6. Organization of the argument

7. Syntax, diction, punctuation, spelling, paragraphing

8. References

***RESOURCES FOR RESEARCH PROJECT***

The following journals are health ethics journals and so include articles that count as scholarly ethics literature:

*Bioethics*

*Developing World Bioethics*

*Hastings Center Report*

*International Journal of Feminist Approaches to Bioethics*

*Journal of Bioethical Inquiry*

*Journal of Health Policy, Politics and Law*

*Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics*

*Journal of Medical Ethics*

*Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*

*Journal of Public Health Ethics*

*Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal*

These journals - some philosophy and some health sciences - also contain useful scholarly articles. Articles that focus explicitly on ethics count as scholarly ethics literature:

*American Journal of Public Health*

*British Medical Journal*

*Bulletin of the World Health Organization*

*Globalization and Health*

*International Health*

*Journal of the American Medical Association*

*The Lancet*

*Medicine, Conflict, and Survival*

*New England Journal of Medicine*

*Science*

*Social Science and Medicine*

Other excellent resources that can count as scholarly ethics literature:

*\*Encyclopedia of Bioethics,* 4th edition (available online through the GMU library)

\**Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (available online)

\*Publications and reports of governmental or non-governmental organizations and agencies engaged in research, practice, and policy work in global health and/or ethics. For example: Centers for Disease Control (CDC), International Red Cross and Red Crescent (ICRC), World Health Organization (WHO), Nuffield Council on Bioethics, etc.

\*Policy statements or other ethics documents from international health and/or humanitarian organizations such as the International Committees of the Red Cross and Red Crescent (ICRC), Doctors without Borders (MSF), the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO), the Word Health Organization (WHO), and many others.

**APPENDIX 2**

**BOOK AND ANALYSES**

**Important to note:**

1. Value: 20 points (10 +10)

2. Recommended length: 2 pages, double spaced; 10 minute oral presentation

**Description:**

Select a book of your choice that is relevant for global health and raises ethical issues, then let me know so that I can approve or suggest something else. You will read it throughout the term. We will meet at the end of term for oral presentations with handouts. Students will also write short critical essays following the structure below:

1. Concisely state the author’s thesis and briefly explain how the author develops it.

2. Identify between one and three ethical issues raised in the book. Introduce each

3. Explain the ethical issues in detail.

4. Explain how in your view the author’s work helps us to uphold ethical ideals.

***Here are some I can recommend:***

1. Naomi Oreskes and Erik M. Conway. 2011. *Merchants of Doubt: How a Handful of Scientists Obscured the Truth on Issues from Tobacco to Global Warming.* Bloomsbury Press.

2. Grace Chang. 2000 or 2016\* editions. *Disposable Domestics: Immigrant Women Workers in the Global Economy.* South End Press or Haymarket Books\*.

3. Ben Rawlence. 2017. *City of Thorns: Nine Lives in the World’s Largest Refugee Camp.* Picador.

4. Jared Diamond. 1999. *Guns, Germs, and Steel: The Fates of Human Societies.* W.W. Norton & Company.

5. Jose Saramago. 1999. *Blindness.* Harvest Books.

6. Howard Markel. 2005. *When Germs Travel: Six Major Epidemics that Have Invaded America and the Fears They Have Unleashed*. Vintage Books.

7. Allan M. Brandt. 2009. *The Cigarette Century: The Rise, Fall, and Deadly Persistence of the Product that Defined America.* Basic Books.

8. Tracy Kidder. 2004. *Mountains Beyond Mountains: The Quest of Dr. Paul Farmer.* Random House.

9. Mireille Kingma. 2005. *Nurses on the Move: Migration and the Global Health Care Economy.* ILR Press.

***CRITICAL ESSAY EVALUATION***

1. Explanation of author’s thesis or main objective

2. Introduction of ethical issue(s)

3. Explanation of the ethical issues

4. Explanation of how the authors’ work helps people (anyone in particular?) better understand and address ethical concerns.